



*Scottish Christianity in the Modern World* Edd. Stewart J. Brown and George Newlands. Edinburgh: T. and T. Clark, 2000. Pp. vi + 323. Price £24.95. ISBN 0 567 08765 4

Modern historians working, as they see it, in the social, economic and political “mainstream” of the discipline can sometimes appear a trifle dismissive – perhaps through ignorance or indifference – of their colleagues in church history. Not only are many church historians physically cloistered away in Divinity faculties where, it is rumoured, different standards of “Truth” and objectivity prevail, but, as the Church finds itself displaced from its central position in society, so church history, by the lights of “mainstream” historians, has also lost a wider relevance, becoming detached from the dominant institutions and burning controversies of the modern age. How far from the reality, yet how compelling – as one knows – the misrepresentations. The myth of pious, self-serving and insulated denominational history should be dispelled by the twelve substantive essays presented in *Scottish Christianity in the Modern World*, which extend in scope from the Ecclefechan of Carlyle to the role of Scots Presbyterianism in New Zealand and Malawi. The contributors, moreover, are not afraid to grapple with a number of thorny topics which have damaged the reputation of the Kirk. Appropriately, these essays are published as a festschrift honouring the career of Professor Alec Cheyne, whose own work exemplifies the best practice of church historians in the second half of the twentieth century. In their Introduction, Jay Brown and George Newlands note that Professor Cheyne – who was trained as an historian at Edinburgh and Oxford, and who taught general history at Glasgow – “has never viewed ecclesiastical history as an isolated sub-discipline, separated from the rest of the historical enterprise” and that he regarded “the methodology of the Church historian” as “essentially the same as that of other types of historian”. The Editors praise the “refreshing tentativeness” of an historian “impatient with those who claim certain knowledge of historical truth, based on some infallible system, whether theological or philosophical”.

Professor Cheyne is known for the breadth his historical sympathies, and this liberality is exemplified in the wide range of contributors to his festschrift, by no means all of whom are his Scots

Presbyterian co-religionists. Indeed, the spectre of “Scotland’s Shame”, the hostility shown by Scots Presbyterians to the Irish Catholic community, stalks the pages of this volume. John McCaffrey, in a fascinating exploration of Scottish reactions to the Great Irish Famine of 1845-52, rightly upbraids those historians who, unconsciously inheriting earlier pejorative usages, employ the term “immigrants” when referring to the Irish presence in nineteenth-century Scotland. As McCaffrey points out, after the Union with Ireland in 1801, “constitutionally as well as economically”, the increasing numbers of Irish-born in Scotland “represented just another movement of labour adjusting from the narrowing opportunities in one part of that United Kingdom to areas of growing labour demand in another”. McCaffrey sheds light on the dark and unheroic underside of Presbyterian Scotland in the age of the Disruption when many commentators, in effect, blamed the supposed fecklessness of the Catholic Irish for their plight, which was starkly contrasted with the conspicuous virtues and freedoms of Saxon Protestantism. Nevertheless, McCaffrey is careful to set out the economic and demographic forces which exacerbated Scots Presbyterian anxieties, and highlights generous exceptions to nativist censoriousness, including an elderly Thomas Chalmers, who firmly rejected the notion that the Irish had brought this tragedy upon themselves.

However, as Jay Brown demonstrates in his essay on Presbyterians and Catholics in twentieth-century Scotland, Presbyterian hostility to the Irish, which might be explained, if not excused, by the undeniable traumas of the 1840s, reached its highest pitch in the inter-war period. Indeed, Brown reminds us that there are demonstrable links between anti-Irish xenophobia and the successful Presbyterian church Reunion of 1929, not least by way of the Reverend John White’s sinister vision of a reunited national Kirk as the guardian of Scotland’s racial purity. Nor is there any attempt to sanitise the more recent past. Brown sets out the details of the Mackey affair of 1979, outlining the Kirk’s decided unease at the appointment of James Mackey – a married Irish Catholic priest and professor at a Jesuit university – to the Thomas Chalmers Chair of Divinity at New College. Alec Cheyne was himself a participant in this row. Although the Kirk did not heed Professor Cheyne’s plea to distinguish education

from indoctrination, nevertheless, as Brown notes, whatever the Assembly's misgivings on this single issue, these concerns did not take the form of a more general anti-Catholic witch-hunt, and the successful visit to Scotland of Pope John Paul II in 1982 signalled a growing rapprochement between the Kirk and Scottish Catholicism. However, David Thompson's detailed exploration of the vexed negotiations which preceded the intra-Presbyterian Reunion of 1929 warns against extravagant ecumenical aspirations. Thompson contends that the very model of the 1929 reunion has made it difficult to the Kirk to "think ecumenically in any other terms than absorption".

Even Queen Victoria, it seems, faced formidable objections from courtiers and churchmen, when in 1871 she made known her desire to take communion among her Presbyterian tenants and estate workers at Crathie Church. This is the subject of an elegant and penetrating study by Owen Chadwick, which illuminates the political and ecclesiastical sensitivities generated by Britain's curious and asymmetrical system of plural establishments. Did the Queen's position as supreme governor of the Church of England automatically place her – as some of her advisers seem to have believed – "outside" the Church of Scotland? Although the Queen was bound, by an oath taken at her Accession Council, to maintain the "government, worship, discipline, rights and privileges" of the Church of Scotland, she was reminded that she was a communicant of the Church of England, which was not in communion with the Church of Scotland. After many hesitations, the sovereign would eventually take communion – or was it illicit inter-communion? – in the Established Church of Scotland only in November 1873.

The Queen's scruples appear almost ridiculous against the backdrop of Victorian unbelief, whose rise is surveyed by William Ferguson in an essay which is characteristically wide-ranging, learned and authoritative, not to say robust; indeed, it includes a resolutely unsentimental account of the Aikenhead case. As Ferguson shows, Scottish philosophers, geologists and biologists made a distinctive contribution not only to the emergence of a critical irreligion, but also to a rich and under-appreciated countercurrent of apologetic, in which the core of Christian belief was reconciled with apparently destructive scientific developments. In the long run, the findings of the Higher

Critics were to prove just as destructive as those of the Darwinians. However, as Barbara MacHaffie shows, in a fascinating and unexpected essay, there was a window of opportunity in the late nineteenth and early twentieth centuries when there were strenuous efforts to communicate the lessons of Believing Criticism to children in schools and Sunday schools. A revolution was attempted in the teaching of the Old Testament, with a self-conscious attempt to abandon “fact-lore”, recitation and the drilling of children in the identification, as one commentator complained, of Huppim, Muppim and Ard, as well as the latitudes of Beersheba, Kirioth and Beth-Gamul; in its stead, there emerged a project to build a proper body of religious education on the basis of the latest developments in Biblical hermeneutics. What was the point of instilling the old orthodoxies into children, if, when they reached adulthood, they confronted for the first time an unfamiliar set of textual problems associated with the Bible, and then lapsed into a sceptical, irreligious outlook? Introducing schoolchildren to the broad findings of Biblical criticism, with an emphasis upon the spiritual and moral truth of Bible stories rather than upon their historicity, was a necessary inoculation against such scepticism. It is perhaps no surprise, given the intellectual challenges which it presented to both teachers and children, that this pedagogical revolution came to nought; yet it now seems extraordinary (and sad also to think it so) that this revolution was even attempted. MacHaffie’s downbeat conclusion is not untypical of the essays in this volume, which square up with fortitude to the high tragedies, petty squabbles and missed opportunities of our history – to the very obstinacy of the world as it was and is. Such an approach, alas, yields little in the way of uplift or consolation, but marks a fitting tribute to Alec Cheyne and to the most rigorous kind of ecclesiastical history.

COLIN KIDD

*University of Glasgow*

*Fasti Ecclesiae Scoticae*. Volume 11, Edited by the Reverend Dr Findlay Angus John Macdonald. T. & T. Clark, Edinburgh. 2000. Pp. ix, 507. Price £60. ISBN 0 567 08750 6

At the outset, it might be useful, prior to reviewing the eleventh volume of the present *Fasti Ecclesiae Scoticae*, to compare the first seven volumes with the first edition, edited by the initiator of the project, Hew Scott, as the vast majority of the material came from his own hands and gave all Scottish church historians a respect for his scholarship.

He was born in 1791, the son of Robert Scott, an excise officer in Haddington, who died a decade later. Thereafter, his mother, Catherine Dunbar, opened a small shop and her son was soon apprenticed to a local ironmonger. By the age of twenty, he had set himself up as a bookseller. Scott studied at the University of Edinburgh from 1813 to 1820 and attended thirteen classes, including Greek, sitting under Professor George Dunbar, a kinsman, who probably had an influence on his life. For two sessions he was the assistant librarian at the university and, in recompense, his matriculation fee was remitted. He graduated M.A. at Aberdeen in 1816 as the fee there was more modest. Some time after commencing his studies, he came to the notice of Thomas Thomson, deputy clerk-register of Scotland, in the General Register House, and became one of his assistants. His contacts with the world of scholarship owes much to his years there where, in addition to his duties, he began collecting material which was used for his *Fasti*. He was ordained, in 1829, for service in Canada as he had been licensed by the Presbytery of Haddington in 1820 but had been unsuccessful in being presented to a parish. His influential friend, Dr David Laing, encouraged him to remain in Scotland and his researches remained uninterrupted. Laing and Thomson set scholarly editorial standards which he followed. Eventually, in 1839, he was presented and inducted to the parish of Anstruther Wester where he remained until his death in 1872. An interesting contact was Charles Rogers, who assisted him in his parish for a short time after 1846, and became minister of the North church of St Andrews for a year from July 1849, before founding the Grampian Club in 1868 and becoming the secretary and historian of the Royal Historical Society, London, from the same year until 1880.

Scott, therefore, had the skills and scholarly connections which prepared him well for his self-appointed task which his successors lacked. His outstanding palaeographic experience was obvious: posthumous acknowledgement, for example, to his work is recorded in Francis J. Grant's preface to *The Commissariat Record of Edinburgh. Register of Testaments, 1514-1600* (Edinburgh, 1897). The lists of publications of ministers, in the volumes, owed much to his experience as an independent bookseller and his two sessions as assistant in Edinburgh University Library when he doubtless accumulated much of the bibliographical information. The genealogical details, giving information regarding the ministers' families, accumulated over the years, set a standard which was unfortunately not followed in the second edition and later volumes. It is a great pity that the subsequent considerable contribution made in many spheres of life by manse children cannot be found as given in the earlier volumes. This would make it almost impossible for anyone readily to produce a companion volume to A.W. Ferguson's *Sons of the Manse* (Dundee, 1923). It is amusing to find that "issue" in previous volumes is replaced, in volume eleven, with "children" even where there is but one child. Some marriages only record the surname of the father-in-law!

The second edition showed a lack of the careful, time-consuming work compared with the first, with the result that there is not as much detailed information there as in the entries taken over from the first edition. There are, in fact, some deletions even made in the earlier entries. Opportunities were missed in 1950 to provide more detailed addenda and corrigenda in volume eight. One example of this was the failure to take advantage of the possible amendments to that volume which might have been had from Gordon Donaldson, even although acknowledgement is made there of his assistance. William Stephen, minister of Inverkeithing, was responsible for this to some degree. However, he may have been aware that time was not on his side, as he died four years before the publication of the volume. One incident can be mentioned. Stephen misread the Register of Presentation to Benefices, and named the prior of Killin, in 1585, sir Maktor Whitehill which Donaldson identified as sir John Maccorquodale. As a result, Maccorquodale can be found subsequently in four entries in

Charles H. Haws, *Scottish Parish Clergy at the Reformation, 1540-74*, who, along with the work of Dr Donaldson, has since considerably supplemented the information lacking in volume eight. A notable omission from those consulted at that time was D. E. Easson, the finest record scholar within the ministry of the Church of Scotland, who never held an academic post in Scotland but was subsequently a professor in the University of Leeds. The basic problem at that stage may well have been that a committee, few of whom had any relevant knowledge in the subject, were in a rush to get the text finalised and published, although, under slightly different arrangements, the subsequent volumes did not always show all the requisite improvements. It is to be regretted that little opportunity was taken to include corrections and addenda in volume eleven, apart from one or two by the individuals, still alive, who submitted corrections to the previous volume.

It is obvious that the editorial assistant of volume eleven, by dint of her background, has had to rely almost solely on the completed forms returned by the individual ministers concerned and, in many cases, the presbytery clerks have failed to supplement information lacking in the forms or to obtain details of deceased ministers or those having demitted charges without supplying the necessary material. The inevitable customary blanket thanks to those clerks covers much, but not their sins of omission! In addition, the records of the Pension Scheme of Ministers and Overseas Missionaries were not properly scrutinised.

At the outset, it has to be said that it was a peculiar and irrational choice to conclude the volume on 30 September 1999. However, curiously, the editor has not always concluded the volume on that date. The appointment of "the moderator-designate of the general assembly of 2000-2001", did not come to pass until after the concluding date of the volume. Mention is also made of contributions to *The New Dictionary of National Biography* which has still a fair period of gestation to experience, while there is a hopeful entry of the first part of another publication noted as "forthcoming"! On the other hand, the editor and the appropriate presbytery clerk have failed to ensure that some entries were adequately completed for events prior to the end of September, e.g. there is simply a bland entry of the date of

induction of Mrs Sara Embleton to St Serf's, Leith, on 28 September 1999, and nothing else. This is all the more surprising as she was employed within the Presbytery of Edinburgh as a hospital chaplain prior to her induction and was well known to the presbytery clerk. Another example can be found in the case of Hilary W. Smith ordained and inducted to Caddonfoot with Galashiels, St Ninian's, on 23 September 1999. There are three entries for Peter Robertson in the presbytery of Moray where he served for ten years but there are no biographical details.

The previous volume ended on 31 December 1975, which was an obvious decision, in view of the readjustment of the presbytery structure which was inaugurated on 1<sup>st</sup> January of the next year. It would have been logical to continue the entries in volume eleven to 31 December 2000, as was initially anticipated, to ensure that the subsequent volume, if ever produced, would cover the first twenty five years of the third millennium. Little historical understanding was in the background to advise on this and many other matters. Furthermore, with a very considerable subsidy to cover the initiation costs, there was no need to push on with publication, within a few months of the obvious closing date, unlike the previous volume, whose editor took some time after the information was gathered. More importantly, in addition to the proof reader, it would also have been possible for at least one or more professional individuals, with a more intimate knowledge of the subject to be appointed. This would have given much needed guidance and opportunity to have made the many needed corrections.

The contents of volume eleven are similar to the preceding one but there are some changes, most of which are unfortunate and some irritating. One example is the list of the moderators of the general assemblies, included in the first edition on the suggestion of Thomas Gordon, minister of Newbattle. In the past, moderators have been listed with offices, honours and degrees held during their "moderatorial year" but now, in certain instances, degrees, honours, etc., received later, have been added, while, in other cases, this has not been done. However, there have also been omissions. Fortunately Andrew Heron's entry is left as it was, reminding the historian of his defence of some Glasgow University students prior to his election as

moderator, which resulted in his not receiving a D.D. from his own *alma mater*. The entry for John R. Gray, gives a D.D. awarded after his period as moderator, under Dunblane, but there is no mention of its conferment in the list which came later, and not from a British university. Some may question the inclusion of banking and insurance post-nominal initials indicating the passing of such professional examinations, particularly when only the degree of D.D. and the related nomenclature of Dr appears in the minutes of general assemblies, irrespective of what institution confers the degree! However, in contradistinction to previous volumes, the novel practice of now omitting prestigious fellowships, e.g., FRSE from Professor John MacIntyre and, in view of other post-moderatorial insertions, FRSE and FBA from Professor T.F. Torrance, is astounding. Of the ten later insertions, two need to be mentioned. First there is Professor Robin Barbour whose KCVO is recorded but there is no mention in his entry of his appointment as Dean of the Chapel Royal. (There are also at least two Chaplains in Ordinary to Her Majesty whose appointments are omitted from their entry.) The other crass error (where it came from would be interesting to discover!) is the demotion to Depute Chaplain General to describe the former Chaplain General to the Forces, whose appointment to that position was an important historical event for the Church of Scotland, particularly in the face of opposition from the then archbishop of Canterbury, Robert Runcie. In addition, there is the strange editorial conferment of a degree of LB, whatever that is meant to imply, by the presbytery clerk of Edinburgh, who was unable to supply a solution although providing the information! It is to be hoped that there will be a return to the previous practice of listing ex-moderators as designated during their year of office, thus avoiding confusion.

Fortunately, the Lord High Commissioners have been left in their original state. It is unfortunate that the *Church of Scotland Year Book, 2000-2001* has also added such degrees in this way but again only partially. The reviewer has gone into this section in some detail, not because of any inflated idea he may have about moderators, but to illustrate his concern regarding various aspects of the quality of the publication and the shortcomings of the official editor who is technically secretary to the moderators of the general assemblies.

Replacing the section, “Clerks of Assembly” (*sic*) in the previous volume is “Officials of the General Assembly” which now includes “Precentor”. Whether the person can be actually called an official is a moot point but it does emphasise the innovation of replacing the tradition precentor, who was never a minister, by an ordained minister and listing him. However, it does raise question of the omission, in these circumstances, of the General Assembly Officer who, as the servant of a court of the realm, can be called upon to undertake certain important duties.

The list of the Fathers of the Church, introduced in the first edition and continued until the penultimate volume, has now been omitted. The list was both interesting and a gracious tribute to those long-serving ministers and a reminder of many who never sought place or praise. The absence of this in volume eleven is particularly unfortunate as Professor Norman Porteous, would have been listed as he was born on 9 September 1898, ordained on 26 June 1926, and is still alive and well.

The inclusion of auxiliary ministers is an innovation. They are given pride of place in alphabetical order immediately after the parishes and all appear (with full biographical details), but under the parishes where they are serving. In the light of this, it seems illogical that deacons – there are male and female ones now – who serve, either full or part time in the service of the church and are, like auxiliary ministers, *ex officio* members of presbyteries, are not listed. In addition it should be noted that legislation was framed during the preparation of the volume and passed at the general assembly of 2000 to make all such eligible for election as moderator of a general assembly! It is strange to learn that the appropriate committee of the general assembly was not consulted regarding their omission or inclusion. Probably the matter was never even considered.

The section on “Secretaries” in previous volumes is now given the title of “Other Ministers” which contains a multifarious collection of names, ten of whom, apart from being ordained probationers have never held office within the Church. There seems to be no general principle as to who should be included or not. One of the difficulties facing any reader is to ascertain, without much trouble, the considerable growth in ministers caught up in centralisation and

bureaucracy during the last quarter of a century when membership of the Church has halved.

The lists of publications, in the short biographies, vary greatly in quality from a note of a joint article in the *Scotsman*, contributions to journals ranging in importance and relevance, to very substantial contributions to scholarship. One novelty under publications appears, in some occasional incongruous entries, the full title of unpublished theses, which are now tucked away in libraries; fortunately no further manuscript material appears. This section, displays a lack of any editorial policy, and obviously reproduces uncritically the information provided by the individual concerned. In the original edition, most of such books and pamphlets were the result of research by Hew Scott, and others. While there are some entries which include lists which cause some surprise, such as a list of eight mathematical works included in the details of an auxiliary minister, unfortunately, there are important contributions to theological scholarship and to the history of the Church of Scotland which are missing on account of a lack of editorial initiative. However, before merely citing unseen a volume from such bibliographical information, it is sometimes important to consult the volumes with care. A lesson can be learned from the militant Scottish Episcopalian, M.E.M. Donaldson's *Scotland's Suppressed History* (1935). Referring to Daniel MacLauchlan, minister of Ardnamurchan, deposed in 1757 for deserting his charge three years before, and imprisoned in London, suspected of writing anonymously, *An Essay upon Improving and Adding to the Strength of Great Britain and Ireland by Fornication* (1735), which is recorded in the first edition of the *Fasti*, the author commented that "he had filled up the cup of his iniquity by writing a profane and scandalous pamphlet", without noting that it had been dedicated to a certain noble peer! The editors of the second edition of the *Fasti* were misled too and the bibliographical entry was omitted.

An account of the failure to include some works, around which there have been discussions, three might be mentioned. One, Professor James Barr's *Semantics of Biblical Language*, published while still on the staff of the University of Edinburgh, was a critique of the methodology, reflecting the influence the Kittel's *Theologisches Woerterbuch*, apparent in the reports of the general assembly's Special

Commission on Baptism which met from 1953-61. This was excluded from the previous volume under Barr's completely short, uninformed entry there. Another more incomprehensible omission, from the present volume, along with a missing entry for him under High St Giles, Edinburgh, is Dr Harry Whitley, minister of High St Giles, Edinburgh, who died on 9th May 1976 and the second part of his autobiography, *Thorns and Thistles*, which was completed shortly before his death and launched on publication by Lord George Macleod shortly thereafter. Similarly, the late minister of Glasgow Cathedral, Neville Davidson's posthumous autobiography, *Beginnings but no Endings*, does not appear, nor does his name, in this volume. In view of the biographical nature of the *Fasti*, it is particularly unfortunate that these two books are not recorded.

The section recording ministerial academics has been altered: professors and lecturers are not listed separately. This innovation, like others, is not explained by the titular editor or any other. This may be because the number of ministers of the Church holding chairs in the four faculties of divinity has greatly declined since 1975. The number of retired professors in volume eleven are a score compared with seven now professors and ministers of the church. The gap is not filled by lecturers with eight retired compared with six now holding appointments. There is, however, in this section, the most surprising omission of the late James Blackie, with publications, from the list. He was professor of Christian Ethics and Practical Theology in the University of Edinburgh from 1966 until succeeded by Duncan Forrester in 1978. The full-time clerk of the Presbytery of Edinburgh should have supplied this information. Another name omitted is the uninformative listing of William F. Storrar, as minister of St John's, Carlisle, who is noted as going to an appointment in the University of Glasgow in 1996 but is not recorded as ever arriving there. In the previous volume there is an extensive entry for Professor John MacQuarrie, even after he became an Episcopalian in the U.S.A., while, in the present, Professor James Barr, as mentioned above, is omitted. This is all the more surprising when a significant entry in *Who's Who* would have provided the editor with all the information required. The decline in the number of Church of Scotland ministers serving as theological teachers will probably continue as the

proportion of honours graduates entering the faculties of divinity decreases.

The sense of historic continuity of the Church of Scotland, which was one of its great inspirations from the Reformation, has now disappeared and this is evident from the contents of volume. For a historian, one of the unfortunate alterations in the previous recording of parishes has been the failure to continue to give details of parishes and their ministers up until the time of the union in cases of readjustment. A very sad case is the union of Lochend and Restalrig where the parish church of Restalrig, dedicated to St Triduana, had been from Celtic times and, further, a collegiate church erected in November, 1487 later in that century styled a chapel royal. When united, it became not St Triduana's, but St Margaret's, which had been the name dedication of another Edinburgh parish until 1969, but both are indexed without differentiation and with the same pagination. Collessie, and Cults, dedicated by David de Bernham, bishop of St Andrews, in August, 1243 and the medieval chapel of Kettle, with the addition of Ladybank, are lost under the designation of Howe of Fife. A similar case can be found in the union of three other historic parishes, Fettercairn, Fordoun and Glenbervie now lost under the name West Mearns. The references to the previous volume, at the beginning of such parish entries, are totally inadequate, especially as the former parishes, noted at the beginning of the entry, have not been included in the index so that it is impossible to know into which parish they have been absorbed. As far as more recent parishes are concerned, to take the Presbytery of Edinburgh as an example, as the reviewer has spent half a century within its bounds, a score of such parishes have disappeared from the previous listing, including burgh churches with their own particular place in the history of the city and the church. The failure of many presbyteries to continue the historical nomenclature of parishes is a regretful reminder of the disappearance of a sense of the historic heritage of the Christian church in Scotland.

Some disappearances have nothing to do with a union. A fatuous case is the vanishing of Burdiehouse, Edinburgh (Bordeaux House, with its sixteenth-century interesting connections); the parish now appears as Kaimes Lockhart Memorial, renamed as such in 1989. One wonders if Kaimes was chosen to give overtones of gentility, while a

new Lockhart appeared. He had no connection with the other Lockhart Memorial in Edinburgh which ceased to exist in 1987, originally a chapel of ease and dedicated to St Mungo. The saint was replaced by Lockhart Memorial on becoming a parish church, in memory of Dr Robert Lockhart, minister of Colinton, 1861-1902, whose sister left money to build a church in his memory and used for St Mungo's. The Lockhart, to whose blessed memory Kaimes was dedicated, was another Robert Lockhart, who had the accidental distinction of being the first minister of the parish, and served in Burdiehouse 1951 to 1963, following a tradition which many hoped would die out after the Union of 1929.

Of course, there can be some amusing stories connected with the unions and dedications of parishes. Probably the best incident was when the Presbytery of Edinburgh discussed at great length the name to be given to the union of Broughton Place and Macdonald Road. The name proposed was Broughton Macdonald. Amid a welter of counter proposals, one irate weary presbyter shouted out, "What about Old Macdonald?" That closed the discussion. The other occasion was the proposed saintly dedication to St Mark when it was belatedly realised that there was an Episcopal church nearby bearing that dedication. To keep the parish in alphabetical order in the printed list, it was decided to depart from a biblical saint and so the parish became St Martin's, avoiding the more appropriate historical local dedication – Mary Magdalene!

What is also disturbing is the departure from the previous practice of indicating which church building was retained in each case of union and readjustment and the fate of the vacated building or buildings. The resultant exasperating confusion is further increased, by the ministers of the former parishes being bundled together under the heading of the united charge or charges and thus they can only be identified with their parishes by reading through the complete list. Such newfangledness has created unnecessary difficulties for researchers seeking information, especially those without a fair amount of local knowledge. This innovation could have been mitigated if the original names of the parishes as at 1975 had been indexed and cross-referenced.

The uniting of parishes can produce strange results. The entry in the Presbytery of Perth, where Auchterarder parish is listed as Auchterarder Church and similarly in the Presbytery of Duns, where Duns is also dubbed Duns Church. Dare one suspect a U.P. Free Church underworld still lurking in the offices of ecclesiastical aparatchiks? In the Presbytery of Buchan is found Auchaber United but this does not signify a union of two parishes in Auchaber but a union of Forgue Inverkeithny and Ythan Wells (not Ythanwells as in the text) and Auchaber: two further medieval parish names disappearing from the index.

In the case of newly established parishes, all information is lacking as to which bounding parishes lost parts of their parochial areas to form new parishes. In the case of Cove, within the Presbytery of Aberdeen, all that is recorded, "New Charge 1997". Another example is Culloden, the Barn Church, where the parish was so named on attaining full status in 1990. The origins of it are veiled in mystery too as it is recorded as being a church extension parish in 1975 but there is no record in the previous volume and the first minister was only inducted in September 1977. There is also again no record of the neighbouring parishes involved in its creation.

There are other strange omissions, e.g. under the Presbytery of Aberdeen, the reader would assume that on the retiral of John Mowat, the presbytery were so enlightened as to dispense with a full-time presbytery clerk but, on turning to the entry under Summerhill, Alasdair B. Gordon is shown as having held that position for two years, until a part-time appointment was made before being inducted to that charge.

The listing of ministers since 1975 under the names of the united parishes which have been created since that date is unfortunate. The previous practice of continuing to list the parishes and their incumbents down to the date of readjustment was logical and did not require reference to the index and also meant that details of each union appeared under the heading of the parishes involved. While the inclusion of assistant and associates ministers is not an innovation, as seen from the associates under their own heading in the entry for St Cuthbert's, Edinburgh in volume ten, the failure to put them under a separate heading in the present volume is unsatisfactory. One of the

most peculiar listings is Fairmilehead, Edinburgh, where the associate, appointed after the present minister and with his concurrence, is given pride of place before him!

In *The Scottish Historical Review*, October 2000, a reviewer noted, “Since the mid-1980s, more has been researched in, and published about, the history of modern Scottish Catholicism than about Scottish Protestantism. Indeed, there has been a major dearth in both Church history and social history scholarship of Presbyterianism in Scotland, with relatively few publications concerning what has been the dominant religious tradition of the country. By contrast, Catholicism and sectarianism have been significant publishing fields.” Mention might be made of the Scottish Catholic Historical Association and its publication, *The Innes Review*, which has set a high standard of scholarship since its inception in 1950. With the paucity of those in the theological faculties now teaching Scottish church history, with particular reference to the Church of Scotland (and with only one faculty with a professor of ecclesiastical history where there is another historian with a personal chair), it is hard to decide whether this volume is a witness to such a lack of sufficient background among those who participated in the shaping of the contents of the volume or an added impediment to future possible research, or both.

The volume would have greatly benefited from planning and editing with more time and understanding, with an awareness of the needs of future historians, and with less use of scissors and paste, before rushing into print and with the participation, or at least with the advice, of some experienced scholars aware of the academic significance of such a publication. The high price of the volume, £60, and the poor editing, will be disincentives to those few who might consider purchasing it. The published price could surely have been kept lower if the Church’s own publishers, Saint Andrew Press, had undertaken the work as was done in the case of the previous volume.

Duncan Shaw  
*Edinburgh*

